

Introduction

A monopoly is a business that controls all production of or trade in a product or service. It is rare for a business to become a total monopoly in this sense. In the late 1800s, however, one or two leading businesses in some industries gained control over half or more of the entire market for their products. Growing anger about these trusts, monopolies, or near-monopolies soon led Congress to act. From the Sherman Antitrust Act of 1890 to the “trust-busting” efforts of Theodore Roosevelt, the federal government adopted an increasingly active role in regulating the powerful corporations then emerging. Was this trust-busting a good idea? That is the compelling question this lesson will focus on. In this lesson, students will work with short passages from ten primary sources. These primary sources form the core content for a set of tasks that will help students answer the lesson’s compelling question.

Objectives

Students will work individually and in small groups to respond in a meaningful way to a compelling question about the era of trust-busting. They will apply discipline-specific background knowledge, use scaffolding, and engage in instructional activities to interpret primary sources before presenting their ideas to the class.

C3 Standards Addressed by This Lesson

- ◆ **D1.4.6-8.** Explain how the relationship between supporting questions and compelling questions is mutually reinforcing.
- ◆ **D1.5.6-8.** Determine the kinds of sources that will be helpful in answering compelling and supporting questions, taking into consideration multiple points of views represented in the sources.
- ◆ **D2.His.5.6-8.** Explain how and why perspectives of people have changed over time.
- ◆ **D2.His.11.6-8.** Use other historical sources to infer a plausible maker, date, place of origin, and intended audience for historical sources where this information is not easily identified.
- ◆ **D2.His.12.6-8.** Use questions generated about multiple historical sources to identify further areas of inquiry and additional sources.
- ◆ **D2.His.16.6-8.** Organize applicable evidence into a coherent argument about the past.
- ◆ **D2.Civ.8.6-8.** Analyze ideas and principles contained in the founding documents of the United States, and explain how they influence the social and political system.
- ◆ **D2.Eco.7.6-8.** Analyze the role of innovation and entrepreneurship in a market economy.
- ◆ **D2.Geo.5.6-8.** Analyze the combinations of cultural and environmental characteristics that make places both similar to and different from other places.
- ◆ **D2.Geo.6.6-8.** Explain how the physical and human characteristics of places and regions are connected to human identities and cultures.
- ◆ **D3.1.6-8.** Gather relevant information from multiple sources while using the origin, authority, structure, context, and corroborative value of the sources to guide the selection.
- ◆ **D3.2.6-8.** Evaluate the credibility of a source by determining its relevance and intended use.
- ◆ **D3.3.6-8.** Identify evidence that draws information from multiple sources to support claims, noting evidentiary limitations.
- ◆ **D3.4.6-8.** Develop claims and counterclaims while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both.
- ◆ **D4.1.6-8.** Construct arguments using claims and evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging the strengths and limitations of the arguments.

- ◆ **D4.3.6-8.** Present adaptations of arguments and explanations on topics of interest to others to reach audiences and venues outside the classroom using print and oral technologies (e.g., posters, essays, letters, debates, speeches, reports, and maps) and digital technologies (e.g., Internet, social media, and digital documentary).
- ◆ **D4.6.6-8.** Draw on multiple disciplinary lenses to analyze how a specific problem can manifest itself at local, regional, and global levels over time, identifying its characteristics and causes, and the challenges and opportunities faced by those trying to address the problem.

Common Core Anchor Standards Addressed by This Lesson

- ◆ **CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.1.** Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.
- ◆ **CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.2.** Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas.
- ◆ **CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.6.** Assess how point of view or purpose shapes the content and style of a text.
- ◆ **CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.R.9.** Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.
- ◆ **CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.W.7.** Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects based on focused questions, demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.
- ◆ **CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.CCRA.SL.1.** Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

Teaching Instructions

Compelling Question

Trust-busting: How good an idea was it?

Preparation

Provide all students with a copy of the Introductory Essay. Assign this reading as homework. In addition, assign all relevant parts of your course textbook or other basic reading material. Remind students to keep the compelling question for the lesson in mind as they read.

Asking Questions about Trust-Busting

This part of the lesson stresses Dimensions 1 and 2 of the C3 Framework

Day One

1. Briefly discuss the Introductory Essay in class, and address any initial questions students may have.
2. Distribute the How to Analyze a Primary Source handout. Review each suggestion with the class, and remind students to refer back to the handout as they read the primary sources in this lesson.
3. Divide the class into four small groups. Each group will focus its work on one of the four basic disciplines identified in Dimension 2 of the C3 Framework—history, civics, economics, or geography. As they work, the groups should keep in mind the lesson’s overall compelling question. However, for Day One and Day Two, each group will work mainly with a second compelling question—one related specifically to its assigned discipline.
4. Provide each group with one copy of its discipline-specific Assignment Sheet. Give each student a copy of all the primary sources for this lesson. Each group may share a primary source packet, if necessary.
5. Have students complete the Day One section of their Assignment Sheets. The objective for Day One is for groups to read three primary sources and then formulate one supporting question about each of those sources. The supporting questions should be recorded in the spaces provided on the Assignment Sheet.

Applying Disciplinary Concepts and Evaluating Sources and Evidence

This part of the lesson stresses Dimensions 2 and 3 of the C3 Framework

Day Two

6. Students will return to their previously assigned groups and formulate a claim addressing their group’s compelling question. After reading the remaining seven primary sources, they will select one that supports their claim.

- Using the evidence gathered from primary sources, each group will then prepare a brief (five- to ten-minute) presentation about the era of trust-busting from their group's disciplinary perspective. The presentation can be in the form of an oral report, a debate among group members, or a PowerPoint or similar type of presentation. Allow time for students to prepare by discussing and debating topics among themselves.

Day Three

- Each group will deliver its presentation (prepared by the students as their final task on Day Two). Following each presentation, allow time for class discussion and for a final effort to answer the central compelling question for the lesson.



Communicating Results and Taking Action

This part of the lesson stresses Dimension 4 of the C3 Framework

Students will complete a final project that expresses an understanding of the topic and responds clearly to the lesson's central compelling question. The project may be completed in groups, but students should be evaluated individually.

Distribute the Communicating Results and Taking Action handout, and decide whether you will assign the projects or allow students to form groups and choose tasks on their own. Set a reasonable deadline. Students should review the Trust-Busting Rubric so they can understand how their performance will be evaluated. The projects are summarized below.

Communicating Results

- ◆ Have students study Primary Source 3.1 for this lesson. Ask them to imagine a discussion or debate about this cartoon between Ida Tarbell (Primary Source 3.5) and John D. Rockefeller. Have each student write a series of four letters, starting with one from Ida Tarbell in which she sends Rockefeller the cartoon and expresses her views about it and its relationship to Standard Oil. The next letter should be a response to this letter by Rockefeller. Have students write two follow-up letters, one from each of these two individuals.
- ◆ Many farmers in the late 1800s complained about the unfair power the railroads had over them. Specifically, they complained about the high rates charged, especially in certain farming areas. They said huge railroad corporations used their power to win political favors and make huge profits. On the other hand, railroad owners said they were providing very cheap transportation and were not making all that much profit. Separate students into small groups. Ask each group to choose three primary sources for this lesson that they think could help a historian better understand this issue. Have the groups explain their choices to the class in an all-class discussion of this issue.
- ◆ Separate students into four-member groups. Ask them to read Theodore Roosevelt's ideas about his expanded use of executive power (Primary Source 3.10). Ask students to create a brief role-playing dialogue about this passage. One student should play the part of Roosevelt. The other students should play John Sherman (Primary Source 3.3), Representative Benjamin Butterworth (Primary Source 3.4), and Johnson Newlon Camden

(Primary Source 3.8). Have students discuss their roles, practice a brief role-playing skit, and perform it in front of the class.

Taking Action

- ◆ Many editorial cartoonists have delighted in depicting fat, greedy bosses. Ask students to collect and make copies of as many editorial cartoons portraying corporate leaders as they can find, from the past and the present. Have the class discuss how industrial leaders have been portrayed and how the image of the corporate leader in editorial cartoons has changed over time. Have a group of students create a bulletin-board display available to the entire school and invite others to comment on the display.
- ◆ Based on the work in the previous assignment, students should use some presentation software to create a brief slide show about the cartoon display. Then they should use social media to share the display with others, including local print and television news sources. Have students ask those contacted in this way to comment on the value of this way of comparing past and present.